



VILLAGE OF ORLAND PARK

14700 Ravinia Avenue
Orland Park, IL 60462
www.orland-park.il.us

Department Requested Action

File Number: 2013-0067

Agenda Date: 3/5/2013

Version: 0

Status: IN COMMITTEE
/COMMISSION

In Control: Historic Preservation Review Commission

File Type: MOTION

Title/Name/Summary

Barry House

History

QUICKFACTS

Project

Barry House - 2013-0067

Petitioner

John Barry

Purpose

To construct an approximately 4,000 square foot new single family residence on a 13,301 square foot site at 9825 W. 144th Street, the southwest corner of 144th Street and Beacon Avenue.

Requested Actions: Certificate of Appropriateness

Project Attributes

Address: 9825 W. 144th Street

P.I.N.(s): 27-09-212-014

Size: 13,301 square foot site

Comprehensive Land Designation: Low Intensity Population

Existing Zoning: OOH Old Orland Historic District

Existing Land Use: Single Family Residential

Proposed Land Use: Single Family Residential

Surrounding Land Use:

North: OOH Old Orland Historic District - Financial Institution

South: OOH Old Orland Historic District - Museum (Humphrey House)

East: OOH Old Orland Historic District - (across Beacon Avenue) Single Family Residential

West: OOH Old Orland Historic District - Multi-Family Residential

Preliminary Engineering: Preliminary engineering has been granted. Please refer to the Detailed Planning Discussion section for more details.

OVERVIEW AND BACKGROUND

The petitioner is proposing to construct an approximately 4,000 square foot new single family home in the Old Orland Historic district at 9825 W. 144th Street, the southwest corner of 144th Street and Beacon Avenue. The new single family dwelling will replace the historic single family home. According to the 2008 Residential Area Intensive Survey (historic building survey by McGuire, Igleski & Associates), the existing home was constructed *circa* 1890 in the National Upright and Wing architectural style. The survey listed the existing structure as being in “Good” condition with “Medium” architectural integrity. It also classified the structure as “contributing” to the character of the historic district.

Despite the classification as “contributing”, the pre-existing building has not been listed as a contributing structure to the historic district since the 1986 historic building survey. In 1991, 9825 W. 144th Street was removed from the list of contributing structures and has remained off the list since then. As a result, the home does not appear in the Local Register of Significant Places in Section 5-110 Landmarks Designation or in the list of contributing structures in Section 6-209. It was therefore not a landmark or a contributing structure to merit additional oversight.

The 2008 survey classification as “contributing” denotes the potential for the structure to regain a contributing structure status through preservation, rehabilitation, renovation etc. However, since Section 6-209 does not regulate the demolition of non-contributing structures in the same way it regulates contributing structures, such preservation, rehabilitation, renovation etc. is not obligatory on the property owner.

The economic downturn and the collapse of the housing market took its toll on the building. Since the 2008 survey, the home was foreclosed and subsequent property owners (banks) did not take good care of the centenarian structure. By the end of 2012, the pre-existing building was in a state of considerable disrepair with significant property maintenance issues. The building was deemed structurally unsound with multiple retaining wall and other building failures (principally the roof). The 123 year old house, already difficult to renovate to modern standards with narrow passage ways and undersized rooms, was demolished in January 2013 in favor of new construction for the site-the proposed single family home.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION & CONTEXT

The petitioner proposes to construct a new single family home in the Queen Anne architectural style. Many buildings in the Old Orland Historic District are predominantly in the National architectural style but there are a few high profile buildings that are in the Queen Anne style, namely the Twin Towers Sanctuary and the Loebe House (both landmarks).

The Queen Anne style is generally characterized by asymmetrical shapes, projecting bays, prominent compound rooftops, wrap-around porches, patterned shingles,

conical towers, dormers and chimneys. The proposed single family home will carry these features and be compatible in style and scale to the Old Orland Historic District.

This petitioner does not request any variances.

The recommendation motion includes the following conditions:

- 1) Submit a landscape plan to deal with the tree mitigation requirements before building permits are issued for construction.
- 2) Introduce a light division in the casement window along Beacon Avenue in order to create the appearance of a two-over-two window.

Overall, the project conforms to the Village's Comprehensive Plan, Land Development Codes and policies for this area.

SITE PLAN

The proposed site plan for 9825 W. 144th Street places the single family residence up against the northeast corner of the site as close to the intersection as possible. This has the advantage of placing architectural elements of the house like the conical tower along Beacon Avenue, enhancing the streetscape profile of the district while allowing the residence to maximize usable rear yard area and avoid unnecessary retaining walls toward the south end of the property.

The site plan indicates that the house will have an attached garage with access off Beacon Avenue. Section 6-209.D.8 of the Land Development Code requires that garages in Old Orland be located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. It does not necessarily require detached garages. The proposed attached garage will be located toward the rear of the lot and behind the principal building.

The historic district is primarily a neighborhood of detached garages. This condition is largely due to the narrow width of the typical, mid-block lot. The proposed project is on a corner lot, providing street access from two sides. The former garage on this property was sited to the back of the lot, with a curb cut on Beacon Avenue. The former location required a number of retaining walls for the garage and its driveway. Due to existing lot conditions and the design of the building, the number of retaining walls is significantly reduced and the attached garage is acceptable in its proposed location.

This is the first single family home proposed in Old Orland with an attached garage since the district was founded. However, there is precedent for attached garages in the historic district, namely 9852 W. 144th Place (on the northwest corner 144th Place and Third Avenue). 9852 W. 144th Place is a Folk Victorian house on a corner lot with an attached garage located at the rear of the building. The attached garage is a later addition to the building but one that predates the creation of the historic district (as a potentially mid-20th century addition).

The precedent for attached garages in the historic district is limited to corner lots and the need to mitigate existing topography (e.g. avoiding steep grades) or other natural features (heritage trees etc.). In this case, a detached garage would require

numerous retaining walls to hold up a structure and its driveway, either from 144th Street or Beacon Avenue.

Nevertheless, the petitioner has indicated to address the new precedent of an attached garage in the historic district with a number of improvements, including a roofline that continues architectural features under the gables and ornamental garage doors facing Beacon Avenue.

Lastly, the proposed attached garage will be a three-car garage but this follows the precedent established by the Humphrey House, which also has a three car garage on the west side of Beacon Avenue.

MOBILITY

Pedestrian and Bicycle:

144th Street provides pedestrian access with public sidewalks that link to the Beacon Avenue business district to the north, the sidewalks on the east side of Beacon Avenue and the sidewalks further down 144th Street.

Vehicular/Traffic:

Access to the site is provided by Beacon Avenue, a local street.

Parking/Loading:

Parking Required - 2 parking spaces per dwelling unit

Parking Provided - 6 parking spaces

BUILDING ELEVATIONS

The proposed building elevations are modeled in the Queen Anne architectural style, which is not as prevalent in the historic district but for two high profile buildings, the Twin Towers Sanctuary and the Loebe House. Both of those buildings and this proposed Queen Anne are located along 144th Street. The proposed home maintains the scale for Queen Anne structures, but may appear larger than the immediately neighboring National style buildings.

The color scheme for this house is proposed to be the following:

Jefferson Tan - a green taupe color - for the horizontal and shake siding;

Cameo - an off-white color tan - for the gable details, fascia, soffits, windows and corner trim boards, the porch columns and balusters, the aluminum gutters, and the garage doors;

Red - a deep red color - for the windows and exterior front and laundry room doors that face the streets;

Driftwood - a grey brown taupe color - for the rooftop asphalt shingles (IKO Cambridge Architectural Shingle)

All of the proposed elevations are primarily characterized by horizontal siding and shakes, which the petitioner has clarified in a letter dated Feb. 13, 2013 to have six inch exposure for the main horizontal siding and eight inch exposure for the shake siding.

Queen Anne style architecture typically has contrasting and varied materials, shapes and textures, particularly in siding forms similar to those proposed in this project. Section 6-209.F.3.f discusses appropriate siding material for the district being narrow wood clapboard siding with four inch exposure. The petitioner has indicated that the main horizontal siding will be Smartside prefinished lap siding, which can either be a wood material or similar to Hardie Board that has been allowed in past projects. In addition, the exposure of the siding is greater than that preferred by code, however past projects have enabled eight inch exposure so long as there is consistency of appearance on the structure. In this case, the house will have a consistency relevant to Queen Anne architecture, with the main siding being closer to code than is typically seen in new construction (e.g. 144th Place and Kelly Grove homes) and the contrasting shake siding larger but still consistent with the overall siding patterns of the district.

All the elevations also have large Queen Anne windows (typically one-over-one) and a number of windows grouped in three. The grouped windows of three per opening is a typical design element of Queen Anne architecture. While this set up has been discouraged in recent National style homes that have been built in the district because it conflicts with the style of those homes, the window groups on this building are appropriate. Two groups of three small windows appear on the north elevation facing 144th Street, while two groups of three large windows appear on the south rear elevation and one group appears under the gable above the garage.

Under the gables on each elevation, the petitioner is also proposing various starburst ornamentation, friezes and corbel designs that will be constructed using trim boards etc. and painted in the cameo color (latter details likely on the tower feature above the main entrance).

Lastly, with the exception of the east elevation facing Beacon Avenue, much of the building has exposed foundation. The petitioner proposes to clad the foundation in "natural" stone material. This is an appropriate application for the base of the building.

Overall, the project was reviewed by McGuire Igleski & Associates and the proposed new house is designed in a contemporary interpretation of the Queen Anne style and does not create a false historic appearance. The overall design is compatible with the character of the district. It is also compatible with the predominant proportions of the district with rectangular, vertically oriented massing and with gable ends facing the street.

North Elevation

The north elevation faces 144th Street and is characterized by large window areas, the central main entrance architectural "tower", the characteristic conical corner turret with finial atop, and the wrap-around covered porch with columns and 1 ¾ inch round smooth balusters.

South Elevation

The south elevation is predominantly the rear elevation of the house. It is

characterized mainly by the siding and the garage's south gable. Two large window groups of three are on this elevation on both the upper and lower stories, however since it is the rear elevation, screened from Beacon Avenue by the garage and typical for Queen Anne architecture, these are considered permissible.

West Elevation

The west elevation is mainly identified by one end of the wrap-around porch at street level, the walk-out basement, which is enabled by the considerable grade change across the site, and the stone chimney which begins at grade and extends to the main height of the building. There is also a rear entrance located at mid-point on the elevation to allow back yard access from the main living spaces of the house. This doorway is not visible from the right-of-way and so is permissible.

East Elevation

The east elevation faces Beacon Avenue and is the longest elevation visible from a street. It is mainly characterized by the wrap-around covered porch encircling the conical tower at the north end of the building. This elevation also has the secondary entrance (laundry room door) and casement windows on the lower level just to the north. The casement windows do not match district standards outlined in Section 6-209. While a casement window is not prohibited in terms of function, its appearance is not typical. A light division should be introduced in the casement window along Beacon Avenue in order to create the appearance of a two-over-two window at least.

The main element of the east elevation is the attached garage at the south end of the building. As noted earlier the petitioner has added ornamental doors to the garage to mitigate its street appearance and architectural features under the gables. In addition, the petitioner has indicated in the letter dated Feb. 13, 2013 that the mass of the garage was minimized by lowering the roof over the garage and dropping the ceiling. As a result, the roof over the laundry entry has been separated from the roof of the garage making the garage appear as a separate element to the building.

TREE MITIGATION

The detailed grading plan indicates the number of trees onsite, the species, the general condition of the trees and the form ratings in a table. According to the plan, eleven trees are slated for removal. Five of these have diameters 24 inches or greater and are considered heritage trees. The other six are not heritage trees but require mitigation. Nearly all of these trees are oak trees with the exception of a single spruce and three arborvitaes.

Section 6-305.1.C Tree Preservation Standards of the Land Development Code outlines the following mitigation requirements for tree removal:

For trees 13-23 inches in diameter, 4 trees at 2.5 inches or 2 trees at 4 inches

For trees 24 inches or greater in diameter, 6 trees at 2.5 inches or 3 trees at 4 inches

In terms of the mitigation, for the five heritage trees, 30 trees at 2.5 inches are required by Code or 15 trees at 4 inches; and for the other six trees, 24 trees at 2.5 inches or 12 trees at 4 inches.

However, Section 6-305.1.C.2 notes that for single family lots “the number of replacement trees may be limited by what can reasonably be accommodated within the available lot area” as approved by the Development Services Department.

The petitioner has indicated that he would like to submit a landscape plan to deal with the tree mitigation requirements. The landscape plan should be submitted before building permits are issued for construction.

DETAILED PLANNING DISCUSSION

Preliminary Engineering

The previous historic house was held in place by three sets of retaining walls: railroad ties at the south property line, railroad ties near the pool area that was at the southwest corner of the site, and a concrete retaining wall just behind the house-- all of which were rotted or broken.

A two-foot retaining wall is proposed just behind the house and its attached garage. This retaining wall is well within Code in terms of height (maximum height is three feet per Section 6-302.C.29) and is less intense than if it were located along the south property line.

Land Use/Compatibility

The proposed land use is compatible with the historic district zoning and the Comprehensive Plan.

Lot Coverage

Maximum - 80%

Proposed - 29.7% (per the letter dated Feb. 13, 2013)

Lot Size

Minimum -- 2,500 square feet

Provided -- 13,301 square feet

The existing lot size is 100 feet x 133 feet. Although a maximum lot width is prescribed by Section 6-209.C.1 for new construction (50 feet), this particular lot is considered an existing condition that is legal non-conforming. It is unreasonable to require a single family home property owner to subdivide a single lot into two lots (60 feet and 40 feet) along 144th Street just to construct one house.

Setbacks

144th Street:

Required - 8 feet minimum, 15 feet maximum

Provided -- 10.3 feet

Beacon Avenue:

Required - (corner side) 10 foot minimum, no maximum

Proposed - 20 feet

Rear Yard:

Required - 30 feet minimum, no maximum

Proposed -- 30 feet

Building Height

Maximum -- 37 feet

Proposed - 37 feet

The decorative finial at the top of the conical tower exceeds the 37 feet. However, this was determined by McGuire Igleski & Associates as an architectural element that was not part of the overall building height (it does not contribute to the mass of the building).

Accessory Structures

A fence is not proposed at this time with this project.

This is now before Historic Preservation Review Commission for consideration.

Recommended Action/Motion

I move to accept as findings of fact of this Historic Preservation Review Commission the findings of fact set forth in this staff report, dated March 5, 2013.

And

I move to recommend to the Village Board to approve the elevation drawings titled "Barry House 9825 W. 144th Street", prepared by Kramer and Associates and dated March 5, 2013, subject to the following conditions, which must be made prior to the Board meeting.

- 1) Submit a landscape plan to deal with the tree mitigation requirements before building permits are issued for construction.
- 2) Introduce a light division in the casement window along Beacon Avenue in order to create the appearance of a two-over-two window.

and

I move to recommend to the Village Board to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for 9825 W. 144th Street subject to the above conditions.